

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

Date of Meeting: February 5, 2016

Time: 8:30 am – 10:30 am

Present: Atheria Smith; Bill Love; Calvin Madlock; Brock Drazen; Louis Quindlen; Rosemary Vazquez; Sadiq B. Ikharo; Shirley Slaughter; Ralph Smeester; Karen Shields; Ron Perez; Mary Beth Benvenuti; Rachel Goodwin; Molly Sealund; Adan Rosillo; Bruce Shapiro; Dettie Del Rosario

Chair/Tri-Chairs: Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo / Louis Quindlen / Molly Sealund;

Guest: Annette Dambrosio Amy Marshall, Laney

Facilitator/Recorder: Atheria Smith / No Recorder

Absent: Helena Lengel; Tina Tomlinson; Siraj Omar; Windy Franklin

Excused: Phyllis Carter; Shuntel Nathaniel; Hoi Ko

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} |
|---|---|--|---|
| Meeting Called to Order | 9:10 am | | |
| 1. Agenda Review | Agenda approved. Item VII was removed as it is a duplicate. | | Motion by Louis Quindlen, 2 nd by Rachel Goodwin to accept the agenda, as amended, passed unanimously. |
| 2. Review & Adopt 12/4/16 Meeting Minutes | <p>Minutes were approved, as written with no changes.</p> <p>Dr. Ikharo introduced DGS newly hired Director of Facilities Operations, Bruce Sharpio. He will replace Olivia Rocha, Interim Director of Facilities Operations.</p> <p>Dr. Ikharo asked for nominee(s) or a volunteer to represent the DFC at the DEC meetings.</p> <p>Bill Love was nominated and accepted with a unanimous support from</p> | Notification will be sent to the Chairs of both the DEC and PBC that Bill Love will represent DFC at the DEC meetings. | Motion by Quindlen, 2 nd by Bruce Shapiro to accept the 12/4/16 meeting minutes, as written, passed unanimously. |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved) |
|---|--|---|--|
| | <p>the committee membership to represent DFC at the DEC meetings. He mentioned that he already services as a DEC member and commented that this may be an issue.</p> | | |
| <p>3. Report on Status of ACCJC Recommendation #3</p> | <p>Dr. Annette Dambrosio reported on the progress of ACCJC Recommendation #3.</p> <p>She provided background information, her task is to work on the District Recommendations, and summarized Recommendation #3 as it relates to facilities. She added that the District needs to show improved genuine collaborations between the District and the Colleges and this needs to be documented.</p> <p>The District already has an action plan to remove sanctions and we are working on narrative documents for all eight (8) Recommendations. The timeline for the District to respond to the Commission was summarized. Final response is due to the Commission by October 1, 2016. Information, as it is gathered, such as Action Plans, will be posted on the accreditation home webpage. She also added that committee members may contact her with questions or concerns.</p> <p>Discussions ensued with the following highlighted topics:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are the right people being interviewed when the Accreditation Team visits Peralta? The consensus is that there is a need to have a roadmap, who did they talk to? When were meetings scheduled, etc.? Currently meeting arrangements do not seem to be openly shared; • The action between infrastructure and facilities needs vs. allocated funding is disconcerted. | <p>Rosemary to send Annette's contact information to DFC committee members and link to Accreditation webpage.</p> | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved) |
|---|--|------------------|--|
| | <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Historically collaboration between the District and the Colleges has not been an issue with the Commission. Why now? Is it because Peralta is an urban college? <p>Dr. Ikharo reported that collaboration between the Colleges and DGS has already begun. So far, DGS team has already met with COA and Laney’s teams to share project, budget and planning information and, as a team, discuss other facilities matters in support of student learning and achievement as it relates to facilities. Merritt and BCC meetings are forthcoming. Plans are to have these collaboration meetings reoccurring monthly.</p> <p>Periodic progress reports will be made to this committee has they arise.</p> <p>Accreditation webpage: http://web.peralta.edu/accreditation/</p> | | |
| <p>4. Reports: College Facilities Committees (Each College to five a 5 minute report)</p> | <p><u>Merritt (Brock Drazan)</u> College Facilities Committee discussions included:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Stationary Engineers assigned to Merritt <p>Dr. Ikharo informed Brock that this is not the forum to discuss personnel items. This is a conversation between him and the College President. He will contact the College President to discuss this item.</p> <p>Bill Love concurred that there are venues to discuss personnel matters.</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Status of work order request to re-core several rooms in Building D | | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} |
|-------------|---|------------------|--|
| | <p>Dr. Ikharo explained that Building D has been decommissioned, until a decision has been made on the future use of the building. He will contact the College President to further discuss this work order request.</p> <p>Dettie del Rosario asked for clarification. Student Association is requesting permission to paint a mural inside Building R. Who should they contact? Per Dr. Ikharo, this is a college leadership decision and that they should contact the College President to discuss. He added that if a decision is made to paint a mural, DGS can provide the College support services.</p> <p>Dr. Ikharo also reported on signage at Merritt. DGS has developed a comprehensive plan to address directional and way-finding signage issues at Merritt, campus-wide. Proposals are being solicited. Gary Banks is the Project Manager. The Chancellor and Merritt President are in discussions to resolve issues relating to the smoking signage.</p> <p><u>Laney College (Amy Marshall for Phyllis Carter)</u> On behalf of the College Facilities Committee, she asked Dr. Ikharo for a status report regarding the following items:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. 2-Way Radios Dr. Ikharo reported that the 2-way radios have arrived, but repeaters need to be installed first before they are functional. Laney has the required outlets with electrical issues/resolution being discussed regarding the other colleges. It is estimated that by the end of February 2016, Laney will have functional radios. Bruce Shapiro will follow-up. 2. New Work Order System Dr. Ikharo reported that once the vendor’s contract has been | | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} |
|-------------|---|------------------|--|
| | <p>executed, the project can move forward. Maintenance Connect is the selected vendor. He also gave a brief summary of the software features and overall benefits.</p> <p>3. Broken Window, Campus-wide Dr. Ikharo reported that estimated costs are over the threshold and that DGS will bid these services out. Since Laney is an “open campus” there needs to be a compressive plan to address repeated broken windows and other damages to the college.</p> <p>Louis commented that the resolution passed by this committed included a recommendation <i>“that the District conduct a facility condition index (FCI) to be used as the bases for personnel allocation and management”</i>. He added that he believes that assessments were conducted in the past and asked if they will be updates?</p> <p>Molly Sealund commented on the importance of having an FCI in place to be used as a resource for the Master Plan, which is due in May 2016. She asked DGS for assistance to expedite the process.</p> <p><u>College of Alameda (MaryBeth Benvenuti)</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Painting project is in the bidding phase; • Discussion on the Bookstore Renovation Project is ongoing; • Furniture for DSPS is moving forward: • ADA study – what is the status? <p>Atheria Smith reported relating to the ADA issues indicating that the RFP process is complete. A vendor has been selected (MIG) to begin the development of a comprehensive plan to address ADA issues at Merritt & COA. Once the contract negotiations are complete and the contract is executed the work can be begin. Target Date: By the end</p> | | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} |
|---|---|---|--|
| | <p>of February 2016 or by early March 2016.</p> <p><u>Berkeley City College (Shirley Slaughter)</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • A space has been identified for swing space; • 2118 Milvia Property - An Architect has been identified; • Discussions are ongoing regarding deferred maintenance projects; • Duress buttons – what is the status. <p>Per Dr. Ikharo duress buttons will be part of the Access Control Project, Districtwide</p> | | |
| <p>5. Report 2014-15 Schedule Maintenance Allocation & Status</p> | <p>Director Shapiro provided information regarding the 2014-15 Schedule Maintenance projects which included budget allocation information and project status.</p> <p>There are concerns there are no timeline, this may give the impression that the projects will not be done in a timely manner</p> <p>Dr. Ikharo reported that the majority of the projects are targeted to be substantial completed by the end of June 30, 2016. The remaining projects will be completed before the State’s required deadline of June 30, 2017.</p> <p>The Emergency Blue Phone project is targeted to be substantially completed by December 2016.</p> <p>In response to inquiries on what will happen if there are funds remaining after all the projects on the list are completed, Dr. Ikharo stated that if there are any remaining funds they will be reallocated and the colleges will have the opportunity to utilize remaining funds for other proposed scheduled maintenance project that meet the States’</p> | <p>Periodic status updates will be provided, as they arise.</p> | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} |
|---|--|------------------|--|
| | <p>requirements and that can be completed before the 6/30/17 deadline.</p> <p>Dr. Ikharo indicated that updated status reports will contain the targeted completion dates.</p> | | |
| <p>6. 2015-16 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance (Revised)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Briefing of resolution passed by PBC at their 1/29/16 Meeting <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ○ Life & safety projects ○ Request for a list of estimated | <p>Dr. Ikharo reported that at the 1/29/16 PBC meeting the membership endorsed the allocation of the 2015-16 State funds for deferred and scheduled maintenance as proposed by the DFC and DGS. They passed the following motions:</p> <p style="padding-left: 40px;"><i>“Moved to adopt/endorse the proposed scheduled maintenance projects (Version 2), updated on 11/17/15, with priority to those items ranked health and safety concerns, based upon DFC recommendations which used an established rubric. The PBC will receive a timeline for completion of the projects”</i></p> <p>This item will be discussed at the next Chancellor’s Cabinet meeting.</p> <p>MaryBeth commented the item “COA Painting Project” was paid with college funds. Will this be reimbursed? Dr. Ikharo will discuss this item with her at a separate meeting.</p> | | |
| <p>7. 2016-17 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance Projects</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Funding • Priority Listing from the colleges • For review at the DFC March, 4, 2016 meeting | <p>Dr. Ikharo reported that planning for the 2016-17 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance projects has begun. He asked the colleges representatives, through their share-governance process, to provide a list of proposed schedule maintenance projects. DGS will consolidate all the projects into a master list to be brought back to the DFC for discussion at next meeting (March 4, 2016).</p> <p>For uniformity purposes, DGS will develop a spreadsheet that will</p> | | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|---|------------------|--|-------|--|---------|--|-----|--|-----|---|--|--|
| | <p>include ranking rubric, based on CCC approach to prioritizing. The spreadsheet will be sent to the colleges to be completed along with definition of the regulations set forth general criteria for identifying maintenance projects. This list will be sent to all DFC committee members by the end of the business day today.</p> <p>Dr. Ikharo added that the following DGS staff, if needed, will be available to assist the colleges:</p> <table border="1" data-bbox="585 773 1398 1023"> <thead> <tr> <th>College</th> <th>DGS Staff</th> </tr> </thead> <tbody> <tr> <td>Laney</td> <td>Jason Busby, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer</td> </tr> <tr> <td>Merritt</td> <td>Bruce Shapiro, Dir. of Facilities Operations</td> </tr> <tr> <td>COA</td> <td>Javier Diaz, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer</td> </tr> <tr> <td>BCC</td> <td>Ralph Smeester, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer</td> </tr> </tbody> </table> <p>Next step will be to send DFC's recommendations to the PBC for review. PBC will thereafter send their recommendations to the Chancellor.</p> <p>It was suggested and agreed that the next meeting on March 4th will be a workshop to discuss and finalize the 2016-17 Proposed Schedule Maintenance Projects.</p> | College | DGS Staff | Laney | Jason Busby, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer | Merritt | Bruce Shapiro, Dir. of Facilities Operations | COA | Javier Diaz, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer | BCC | Ralph Smeester, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer | | |
| College | DGS Staff | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Laney | Jason Busby, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Merritt | Bruce Shapiro, Dir. of Facilities Operations | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| COA | Javier Diaz, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| BCC | Ralph Smeester, Assistant Chief Stationary Engineer | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| <p>8. Status Report on DFC/DGS Workshop on Flex Day</p> | <p>Atheria Smith reported on the January 20, 2016 workshop hosted by DFC/DGS to provide an overview of District and College facilities planning. Information presented and discussed included:</p> | | | | | | | | | | | | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} |
|--|---|------------------|--|
| | <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. The status of Educational and Facilities Master Plans; 2. Updates relating to Capital Project, Districtwide; 3. Planning process for major infrastructure issues and status of funding including local and state funds; 4. California Facilities Bond - chances of passing, and what happens if it does not pass; 5. Future Facilities Bond Ballot Initiative, 2016; 6. Five Year Construction Plan - What the colleges need to know as we move forward with our new Educational Master Plans and Integrated Educational /Facilities / Technology Master Plans; 7. Construction Planning. <p>Materials distributed at the workshop are posted on DGS webpage: http://web.peralta.edu/general-services/pbim-facilities-committee/</p> <p>The workshop was a great success and received favorable reviews. DGS is looking forward to hosting additional workshops in the near future.</p> | | |
| <p>9. Assess DFC (to include a written summary of results) regarding the District Service Centers' effectiveness, and its support of all Colleges, including Educational Services, General Services, Human Resources, Information Technology, and Finance.</p> | <p>ACV Madlock reported on the narrative he is working on in response to ACCJC Recommendation #8 which states:</p> <p><i>“In order to meet the Standards, the team recommends that the District systematically evaluate the equitable distribution of resources and the sufficiency and effectiveness of district-provided services in supporting effective operation of the colleges.”</i></p> <p>He presented Information Technology Department (IT) Action Plan to address Recommendation #8. Also provided were the results from the 2015 District Service Center “Customer</p> | | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} |
|-------------|--|------------------|--|
| | <p>Satisfaction” Survey” as it relates to IT.</p> <p>He led a discussion relating to equitable distribution of resources. items discussed included the following highlighted topics / comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • When the Budget Allocation Model (BAM) was originally developed, it was intended to be utilized as a guideline. This document needs to be redefined as the Colleges at PCCD are disproportionate. • Equity should not be done so in a way that will harm the Colleges; • Some Colleges should be made whole; • Who determines how the State Schedule Maintenance funds are allocated? Is it a fair process? • How do we determine equity in terms of Human Resources? Though the District program reviews? • Equity in terms of how recommendations are forwarded to the Chancellor by the PBC is questionable; • When developing Schedule Maintenance lists, state regulated criteria should be used as a basis to prioritize projects. <p>AVC Madlock thanked the committee for the open dialogue and comments. It will be helpful when he writes his narrative. A final draft will be shared with the committee when complete.</p> <p>Dr. Ikhara shared that his is also working on the narrative for ACCJC Recommendation #3 relating to Total Costs of Ownership and is also collecting evidence.</p> | | |

PBIM DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE

ADOPTED – February 5, 2016

| Agenda Item | Discussion | Follow-up Action | Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved} |
|---|--|------------------|--|
| 10. RECOMMENDATION/ACTION ITEMS TO BE SENT TO OTHER PBIM COMMITTEES | None. | | |
| Meeting Adjourned | | | |
| Next Meeting Date | March 4, 2016, 8:30 am to 10:30 am (Workshop re: 2016-17 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance Projects (2 hour meeting) | | |
| Future Meetings | 2016: Apr. 1 st , & May 6 th | | |

Minutes taken by: Rosemary Vazquez

Attachments: All documents and/or handouts for this meeting can be found at: <http://web.peralta.edu/pbi/>