

**PERALTA COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT**  
**DRAFT MINUTES**

DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE MEETING

*September 02, 2016*

*District Office – Department of General Services Conference Room #1*

Chair: Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo • Co-Chair: Louis Quindlen • Facilitator: Annette Dambrosio

**Present:** Bill Love; Molly Sealund; Sadiq B. Ikharo; Louis Quindlen; Shirley Slaughter; Karen Shields; Rosemary Vazquez; Dettie del Rosario; Ron Perez; Rachel Goodwin; Shuntel Nathaniel; Mary Beth Benvenuti; Laura McCarty

**Absent:** Atheria Smith; Adan Rosillo; Antoine Mehouelly; Brock Drazen; Windy Franklin; Helena Lengel; Siraj Omar; Phyllis Carter; Hoi Ko; Osafran Okundaye

**Excused:** None

**Guest:** Annette Dambrosio

| <b>Agenda Item</b>  | <b>Outcome</b>  |
|---|---|
| <b>I. Standing Items</b>  |   |
| A. Call to Order  | 9:10 am   |
| B. Adoption of the Agenda   | Motion by Bill Love, 2 <sup>nd</sup> by Dettie del Rosario to accept the agenda, as presented, passed unanimously.  |
| C. Approval of Minutes (May 06, 2016)   | Motion by Bill Love, 2 <sup>nd</sup> by Rachael Goodwin to adopt the 5/06/16 DFC minutes, as presented, passed unanimously.   |
| D. Elect a Co-Chair (10 minutes )   | Nomination: Louis Quindlen<br>Motion by Bill Love, 2 <sup>nd</sup> by Marybeth Benvenuti to have Louis Quindlen serve as Co-Chair, for the 2017 fiscal year, passed unanimously.  |
| E. Review and Adoption of the Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) Guidelines (30 minutes) | Annette Dambrosio reviewed the Draft TCO Guidelines with the committee. This is working document and will be one piece of evidence for the District’s narrative in response to ACCJC’s Recommendation 3.<br><br>A discussion ensued with the following suggested revisions to the document: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The need to create a TCO Plan did not exist historically (new in the past few years to CCCC’s). Will the development of a TCO Plan conflict with every contractual document PCCD has? This document needs</li> </ul> |

**PERALTA COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT**  
**DRAFT MINUTES**

DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE MEETING

*September 02, 2016*

*District Office – Department of General Services Conference Room #1*

Chair: Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo • Co-Chair: Louis Quindlen • Facilitator: Annette Dambrosio

| Agenda Item | Outcome   |
|-------------|---|
|             | <p>to be developed in a way that it does not conflict with Title V.</p> <p>Page 2:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Include a section that lists any faculty that participated in the planning process;</li> <li>• Add an element relating to hiring personnel explaining the reasons for delays in the procurement and installation of equipment; it was due to lack of manpower.</li> </ul> <p>Page 3:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Add language on the collaboration process between the DGS and the Colleges relating to the development of TCO guidelines.</li> </ul> <p>Page 4:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• (B) – Does this paragraph need to be removed or should it just be updated to reflect the updated Facilities Condition Index that is currently being updated?</li> </ul> <p>Page 5:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Section (3) - Add narrative of process.</li> </ul> <p>Page 10:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Change the title to reflect more analysis rather than projections;</li> <li>• Information is not clear, update projections to include actuals as well as expenditures and commitments</li> <li>• Add notes to explain figures presented for clarification;</li> <li>• A more accurate Capital Project cash analysis will be provided by Director McCarty;</li> <li>• Again, more notes should be provided for clarity.</li> </ul> <p>Pages 16 – 21 (Appendix I – III):</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Replace Appendices I, II, III with APPA Standards – Phyllis Carter to provide the APPA Standards.</li> </ul> |

**PERALTA COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT**  
**DRAFT MINUTES**

DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE MEETING

*September 02, 2016*

*District Office – Department of General Services Conference Room #1*

Chair: Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo • Co-Chair: Louis Quindlen • Facilitator: Annette Dambrosio

| <b>Agenda Item</b> | <b>Outcome</b>   |
|--------------------|--|
|                    | <p>Page 26 – Appendix V:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Add language to clarify that Facilities Condition Assessment (FCA) is for facilities equipment (new building infrastructure and capital equipment) only and does not include classroom equipment;</li> <li>• There needs to be more clarification regarding facilities equipment vs. classroom equipment.</li> </ul> <p>Pages 37 (IT TCO pages 1-10)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The page number will be changed to be consistent with the rest of the document</li> <li>• Director Mehouelley will provide an updated version with corrected information and updated charts by September 9, 2016. Annette explained that some of the suggestions, where pertinent, may be included in revisions to the Recommendation 3 narrative.</li> </ul> <p>A final version will be sent to the DFC committee members by September 14, 2016. Any additional suggestions should be forwarded to Annette prior to that date. Again, Annette reiterated that some suggestions may fit into the Rec. 3 narrative and not the TCO Guidelines document.</p> <p>A discussion ensued on the lack of manpower to address the Colleges facilities work orders and preventive maintenance needs.</p> <p>Discussion included the following points:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• There are issues with the installation of existing equipment and the lack of funding;</li> <li>• The Colleges should develop a separate plan for non-instructional/instructional equipment for future needs.</li> </ul> <p>Dr. Ikharo shared plans to hire more staff for the Maintenance &amp; Operation division. With the additional manpower, the goal is to reduce the number of work orders and address preventative maintenance issues regularly.</p> <p>Dr. Ikharo also provided a status report on the Intergraded Educational, Facilities and Technology Master Plan.</p> |

**PERALTA COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT**  
**DRAFT MINUTES**

DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE MEETING

*September 02, 2016*

*District Office – Department of General Services Conference Room #1*

Chair: Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo • Co-Chair: Louis Quindlen • Facilitator: Annette Dambrosio

| <b>Agenda Item</b>  | <b>Outcome</b>  |
|---|---|
|   | <p>A Request for Proposals (RFP) will be advertised by the end of this month. This will be a collaborative effort between DGS and the Colleges.</p> <p>Motion by Bill Love, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Shirley Slaughter to approve the “Draft Total Cost of Ownership District Guidelines” (revised), dated 8/17/16 as amended, passed by majority.</p> <p>YES: 8; NO: 3; ABSTAIN: 1</p>  |
| <p>F. 2016-17 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance Projects – Priority identification due to insufficient funding from the State (30 minutes)</p> | <p>Dr. Ikharo reported on the Deferred Maintenance (DM) /Instructional Equipment (IE) Allocation reductions from the State.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The adopted State budget reduced DM/IE funding by close to 15% (compared to May Revised);</li> <li>• Peralta’s proportionate share of the FTES pot, system-wide has fallen from approximately 1.83% to 1.70%;</li> <li>• As a result \$1,256,881 was allocated to Peralta to be utilized for scheduled maintenance projects;</li> <li>• A decision needs to be made on which projects will be funded from the 2016-17 Master List of Proposed Scheduled Maintenance Projects.</li> </ul> <p>After a brief review of the list, the committee passed the following motion:</p> <p>Motion by Bill Love, 2<sup>nd</sup> by Rachael Goodwin to utilized the Deferred Maintenance funding (\$1,256,881) allocated by the State to Peralta as follows:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) All the projects listed under “<i>Priority 1 - Protect the Safety of Students &amp; Staff</i>” will be funded (\$865,00);</li> <li>2) The remaining funds (\$391,881) will be utilized for projects listed on “<i>Priority 2 – Prevent Disruptions of Instructional Programs</i>”. Selected projects to be determined.</li> <li>3) Amendment (by Louis Quidlen): DGS will investigate alternative funding to fund all the other items listed in the 2016-17 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance Projects list.</li> </ol> <p>Motion passed unanimously.</p> |

**PERALTA COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT**  
**DRAFT MINUTES**

DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE MEETING

*September 02, 2016*

*District Office – Department of General Services Conference Room #1*

Chair: Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo • Co-Chair: Louis Quindlen • Facilitator: Annette Dambrosio

| <b>Agenda Item</b>   | <b>Outcome</b>  |
|--|---|
| <p>G. Formulation of 2016-17 DFC Goals &amp; Objectives (30 minutes)</p> | <p>The DFC 2016/16 Goals were reviewed. A discussion ensued with suggestion noted.</p> <p>Draft DFC Goals &amp; Suggested Objectives:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Collaborate with the Colleges to continue to implement the Total Cost of Ownership Guidelines.</li> </ol> <p><b><u>Objectives:</u></b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Develop guidelines for a facilities preventative maintenance and scheduled maintenance plan;</li> <li>b. Develop guidelines to evaluate college technology needs of both existing and future maintenance equipment plans.</li> </ol> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>2. Collaborate with the Colleges to continue to implement the Total Cost of Ownership</li> </ol> <p><b><u>Objectives:</u></b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Develop guidelines for a facilities preventative maintenance and scheduled maintenance plan;</li> <li>b. Develop guidelines to evaluate College technology needs of both existing and future maintenance equipment plans.</li> </ol> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>3. Work collaboratively with the Colleges to develop an Intergraded Educational, Facilities and Technology Master Plan.</li> </ol> <p><b><u>Objectives:</u></b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Use Facilities Condition Assessment (FAC) to evaluate FAC repairs and plans;</li> <li>b. Support the Colleges to create a completion timelines for their Facilities &amp; Technology Master Plans to meet project deadlines.</li> </ol> <p>Draft DFC Goals along, with the suggested objectives, will be brought to the Colleges for further discussion through their shared-governance process.</p> |

**PERALTA COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT**  
**DRAFT MINUTES**

DISTRICT FACILITIES COMMITTEE MEETING

*September 02, 2016*

*District Office – Department of General Services Conference Room #1*

Chair: Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo • Co-Chair: Louis Quindlen • Facilitator: Annette Dambrosio

| <b>Agenda Item</b>                    | <b>Outcome</b>                 |
|---------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| <b>II. Carried-Over and New Items</b> | None.                          |
| <b>III. Adjournment</b>               | 11:45 am                       |
| <b>IV. Next meeting</b>               | October 7, 2016 - 9am to 12 pm |

DRAFT