

Peralta Community College District  
**PBIM District Facilities Committee**  
**ADOPTED – March 4, 2016 Meeting Minutes**

**Date of Meeting:** March 4, 2016, **Time:** 8:30 am – 10:30 am

**Present:** Bill Love; Louis Quindlen; Rosemary Vazquez; Sadiq B. Ikharo; Shirley Slaughter; Ralph Smeester; Karen Shields; Mary Beth Benvenuti; Rachel Goodwin; Molly Sealund; Adan Rosillo; Bruce Shapiro; Windy Franklin  
**Absent:** Atheria Smith; Helena Lengel; Tina Tomlinson; Siraj Omar; Jim Cave  
**Excused:** Dettie Del Rosario; Ron Perez; Brock Drazen; Phyllis Carter; Shuntel Nathaniel; Hoi Ko  
**Guest:** Amy Marshall, Laney; Mario Rivas

**Chair/Tri-Chairs:** Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo / Louis Quindlen / Molly Sealund  
**Facilitator/Recorder:** Atheria Smith / No Recorder

Agenda Item	Discussion	Follow-up Action	Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved)
Meeting Called to Order	8:40 am  In the absence a Facilitator, Dr. Ikharo facilitated the meeting.		
1. Agenda Review	Agenda items, accepted as written.		Motion by Bill Love, 2 <sup>nd</sup> by Louis Quindlen to accept the agenda passed unanimously.
2. Review & Adopt 2/5/16 Meeting Minutes	Minutes from the 2/5/16 DFC meeting		
3. Workshop – 2016-17 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance Projects	Dr. Ikharo led a discussion on the Draft 2016-17 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance Projects master list. He began by providing a brief summary of the 2016-17 Governor’s budget proposal as it pertains to higher education and facilities: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The Governor has indicated that to more directly address student needs, the</li> </ul>		Motion by Bill Love, 2 <sup>nd</sup> by Louis Quindlen to accept the Action Plan, as

Peralta Community College District  
**PBIM District Facilities Committee**  
**ADOPTED – March 4, 2016 Meeting Minutes**

Agenda Item	Discussion	Follow-up Action	Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved)
	<p>State is supporting greater student success in higher education;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Funding for scheduled maintenance and instructional equipment for the 2017 school year will be allocated (approximately \$4.4 million for PCCD) pending approval of the budget in June 2016.</li> <li>• A decision will need to be made, through the PBIM process; on how this funding will be divided between instructional equipment and scheduled maintenance projects.</li> <li>• In preparation, this committee will finalize the 2016-17 proposed lists of districtwide schedule maintenance projects to be forwarded to the PBC. For deliberation and recommendation to the Chancellor.</li> </ul> <p>Discussions included the following highlighted point/comments:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Priority items should be addressed first;</li> <li>• Laney’s items reflect their program review;</li> <li>• It was recommended that this committee give a presentation to the Chancellor’s cabinet meeting because the lists of items are so dynamic;</li> <li>• Because the majority of the buildings at Peralta are so antiquated, there will always be a need and not enough funding or staff to address the never-ending maintenance items;</li> <li>• The College Presidents sign-off on their list of proposed scheduled maintenance project, why do they get a second vote? It seems that they do not care about their colleges, especially in urban colleges.</li> <li>• DGS staffing resources are limited to address all the work order requests;</li> <li>• DFC membership support Dr. Ikharo’s proposed reorganization structure of the Maintenance &amp; Operations division that addressing increase staffing needs;</li> <li>• There is a significant administrative burden on Maintenance &amp; Operations managers and staff to process an enormous amount of paperwork. Energies can be spent more productively in serving the colleges;</li> <li>• The payment practice needs to be streamline:</li> </ul>		discussed, passed unanimously.

**PBIM District Facilities Committee**

**ADOPTED – March 4, 2016 Meeting Minutes**

Agenda Item	Discussion	Follow-up Action	Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved)
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• New buildings require staff to maintain them. There are items on the list that require a high-level of expertise;</li> <li>• Per engineering standard, Peralta is in crisis mode;</li> <li>• HR needs to streamline the hiring process:</li> <li>• DGS should consider Local 39 apprentices programs in the meantime;</li> <li>• There is a general consensus that the resolutions and recommendations from this committee and its intent gets lost with</li>   <li>• DFC membership support Dr. Ikharo’s proposed reorganization structure of the Maintenance &amp; Operations division that addressing increase staffing needs;</li> <li>• There is a significant administrative burden on Maintenance &amp; Operations managers and staff to process an enormous amount of paperwork. Energies can be spent more productively in serving the colleges;</li> <li>• The payment practice needs to be streamline:</li> <li>• New buildings require staff to maintain them. There are items on the list that require a high-level of expertise;</li> <li>• Per engineering standard, Peralta is in crisis mode;</li> <li>• HR needs to streamline the hiring process:</li> <li>• DGS should consider Local 39 apprentices programs in the meantime;</li> <li>• There is a general consensus that the resolutions and recommendations from this committee and its intent gets lost with PBC.</li> </ul> <p>In conclusion the committee membership agreed to the recommendation that delegates from DFC will make a presentation at the Chancellor’s Cabinet meeting</p>		

Peralta Community College District  
**PBIM District Facilities Committee**  
**ADOPTED – March 4, 2016 Meeting Minutes**

Agenda Item	Discussion	Follow-up Action	Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved)
	<p>to address DGS, Maintenance &amp; Operations facilities issues districtwide. The objective of this presentation is have an open dialogue in an holistic manner with the intent to meet the following three objectives:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1) Total Cost of Ownership (TCO) Recommendation #3;</li> <li>2) Enrollment Management in light of the 2400 FTE deficiency;</li> <li>3) Resources to meet best practices.</li> </ol> <p>The following six members agreed to be part of the DFC delegation: Bill Love; MaryBeth Benvenuti; Ralph Smeester; Molly Sealund; Louis Quindlen; Bruce Shapiro.</p> <p>The targeted date to make this presentation to the Chancellor’s Cabinet is for either the 3/18/16 or 3/21/16 scheduled meeting. Dr. Ikharo will make the arrangements and will notify the DFC delegation and DFC membership once the date is confirmed.</p> <p>After a lengthy discussion, the DFC committee voted on the following</p> <p><b>ACTION PLAN:</b></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>1. Draft 2016-17 Proposed Scheduled Maintenance Projects (PSMP) master list will be sorted by Priorities: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Priority 1 - Protect the safety of Students &amp; Staff;</li> <li>b. Priority 2 - Prevent destruction of instructional programs;</li> <li>c. Priority 3 - Avoid increased repairs or replacement costs (<i>These items may be completed in-house through the work order process</i>);</li> </ol> </li> <li>2. Director Shapiro will review items on the PSMP and provide engineering cost estimates. Items that do not meet the State criteria will be removed, such as capital projects and/or routine preventative work orders, projects already in progress, etc.</li> </ol>		

**PBIM District Facilities Committee**

**ADOPTED – March 4, 2016 Meeting Minutes**

Agenda Item	Discussion	Follow-up Action	Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved)
	<p>3. DFC will be sent a copy of the revised PSMP with cost estimates;</p> <p>4. 3/18/16 or 3/21/16 Chancellor’s Cabinet: DFC Delegation will make a presentation to the Chancellor’s Cabinet;</p> <p>5. 4/1/16 DFC Meeting: The Membership will finalize the 2016-17 PSMP master list;</p> <p>6. April 29, 2016 PBC Meeting: The DFC will present the finalized 2016-17 PSMP to the PBC membership for deliberation.</p>		
<p>4. Status Report – Facility Condition Index (FCI) Report</p>	<p>Dr. Ikharo gave an update on the status of Facility Condition Index (FCI). He has communicated with the Foundation of California Community Colleges (FCCC) Assessor. The Assessor has indicated that based on the previous assessments (2013) they estimate that it will take two weeks in the field to complete the site survey and another couple of weeks to complete the data entry into FUSION.</p> <p>He will work with FCCC to tried and schedule the first available dates for this assessment. The goal is to complete the FCI by the end of the month and have copies available to the Colleges by early April 2016.</p> <p>A discussed ensued regarding the building life cycle as it refers to the view of a building over the course of its entire life and the definition of Total Cost of Ownership (TCO).</p>		

Peralta Community College District  
**PBIM District Facilities Committee**  
**ADOPTED – March 4, 2016 Meeting Minutes**

Agenda Item	Discussion	Follow-up Action	Decisions (Shared Agreement/ Resolved or Unresolved)
5. Reports: College Facilities Committees (Each College to give a 5 minute report)	<p><b><u>Laney College (Amy Marshal)</u></b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• She thanked DGS for their efforts to coordinate the early distribution of radios to the Laney campus.</li> </ul> <p><b><u>COA (MaryBeth Benvenuti)</u></b>            In response to Mary Beth's inquiries regarding the 2-way radios from COA, Director Shapiro reported that the Contractor is addressing the power and data needs at COA.</p> <p>COA College Facilities Committee discussed the following items at their last meeting:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Now that an Architect has been selected for the ADA Audit, when will they meet with COA? Dr. Ikharo responded that staff will contact her to arrange a meeting;</li> <li>• 2017 Scheduled Maintenance list was vetted;</li> <li>• 20-day Project list was vetted;</li> <li>• Discussions relating to sustainable compose rules;</li> <li>• Discussion relating to electric vehicle locations.</li> </ul> <p><b>Merritt College:</b> No report.            Director Shapiro reported that the lighting issues at Merritt are being addressed.</p> <p><b>BCC:</b> No report</p>		
Meeting Adjourned	10:29 am – Next meeting April 1, 2016, 9:30 am - 12:00 pm		
Future Meetings	2016: May 6th		

Minutes taken by: Rosemary Vazquez

Attachments: All documents and/or handouts for this meeting can be found at: <http://web.peralta.edu/pbi/>