

PERALTA COMMUNITY COLLEGE DISTRICT
CITIZEN'S OVERSIGHT COMMITTEE MEETING

January 13, 2016
MEETING MINUTES

Meeting Time: 3:00 pm to 4:30 pm

Location: Department of General Services, Conference Room #1
333 East 8th Street, Oakland, CA 946

Committee Members (Present):

Michael Mills (Peralta Colleges Foundation), Arthur Kurrasch (Tax Payers' Organization), Zach Unger (Labor Organization), Karen Weinstein (Community-at-Large), Adrien Abuyen (Student College Group), Debra Weintraub (Senior Citizens' Organization)

Committee Members (Absent):

John Caner (Business Organization), Chantal Reynolds (Community-at-Large)

PCCD Staff Present:

Dr. Sadiq B. Ikharo (Vice Chancellor General Services), Ronald Little (Vice Chancellor of Finance & Administration), Jeff Heyman (Executive Director, Public Information, Communications, and Media), Elnora Webb (Laney College President), Lilia Celhay (Laney College VPI), Peter Crabtree (Laney College Dean)

Guests: James Blake (Member of the Public), Danny Beesley (Consultant), Raya Zion (Consultant), Kathy Neal (Contractor)

Minutes Recorded by: Sui Song

MINUTES:

1. Call to Order (Chairperson Mills)

Meeting was called to order at 3:02 p.m. Introductions were extended.

2. Review of Agenda

Motion (Unger, Kurrasch) to approve the January 13, 2016 agenda. APPROVED unanimous.

3. Public Comment

4. Review and Approval of Minutes from October 7, 2015

Motion (Kurrasch, Unger) to approve the October 7, 2015 meeting minutes as amended. APPROVED unanimous.

- 1) Remove "...because of her, the financial reports seem to indicate that money is going elsewhere." (Page 2, third paragraph under Motion to Approve Minutes from May 20, 2015 Meeting)

2) Correction: The location of the last meeting was in Room 801 in the Laney Tower.

5. Review of Draft COC Annual Report (Contractor Kathy Neal)

The current version includes last minute edits. It is still in draft form and at about 80% completion. The photo of the committee taken today will be part of the edit. This report includes expenditures through the end of the fiscal year, June 30, 2015. The numbers have been reviewed by the Finance department and the Department of General Services (DGS). The final printed report will be in a tri-fold document format. Edits will be done offline with Finance and DGS. Once the report is Board approved, it will be emailed and mailed to the committee.

Per VC Little, the report is typically shared with the Board of Trustees in December or January of the subsequent year. He appreciated having Ms. Neal and Chair Mills given authority to make edits and have the document ready for Board approval on January 26th or the first Board meeting of February at the latest.

For clarification purposes, Dr. Ikharo suggested adding an asterisk to highlight projects that are contingent upon the receipt of State funds. The voting on November 2, 2016 for state-wide facilities bond would be used to leverage such projects. Material facts will be clarified with a notation at the bottom of the document, such as different source of funding.

Note: The figures will not be altered.

Motion (Abuyen, Kurrasch) to authorize Chair Mills to have the authority to confirm changes with our Vice Chancellors present. APPROVED unanimous.

6. Reports by Laney College on PASS Program/Measure B Funds (Laney College President Elnora Webb)

The reason why this item is on here and why Laney is focused is two-fold:

- 1) There was a question from the public on the decision making process at Laney.
- 2) There was a related article that appeared in the Express.

This committee's responsibility and its authority: This committee has oversight of the expenditure of the proceeds from the parcel tax. It reviews and affirms its appropriate disbursement and use.

The Committee asked Dr. Webb to clarify the following:

- 1) Funds allocated to Laney. What is the decision making process? How were the decisions made? Who determines Measure B spending as opposed to the General Fund?
- 2) Disbursement process?
- 3) Who determines student success?

Per Dr. Webb, our previous Chancellor came up with the PASS program. In response, all the College Presidents thought it was a great idea to take the surplus parcel tax dollars and incentivize faculty and staff to come up with ideas to strength our capacity as an institution to ensure greater levels of student equity and student success. At Laney we came up with a form to explain what the PASS program is about and how it relates to the parcel tax.

See page 4 of the document that VP of Instruction, Lilia Celhay, created. These are the results of the communication to the college community. Dr. Webb invited everyone to respond, including student leaders. Then Dr. Webb assigned the Institutional Effectiveness Committee to review all proposals and criteria to determine a prioritized order of proposals they should fund and why.

The committee made informal recommendations to Dr. Webb that were shared with the college's faculty and Senate President. Then the recommendations were shared with the college council which is made up of classified, instruction, student leaders, and administrators. What they've recommended was what Dr. Webb approved on page 5.

When the Chancellor made the decision initially regarding the PASS program, he came up with some numbers with the help of then Interim Vice Chancellor of Finance. \$1.8 million for Laney, but the details were not clarified. What was received in writing was \$1.2 million by August. Then by September, the final allocation was \$864,000.

The funds were budgeted in December (page 11). As President, Dr. Webb made the decision to prioritize the projects based on greatest needs.

Note: There was a disagreement on the allocation methodology between Mr. Blake and Dr. Webb.

Per Mr. James Blake, his recollection of the allocation process at Laney was somewhat different. Prior to going to the Institutional Effectiveness Committee, some of the allocations were made prior to the process. The Committee began to prioritize the remainder of the programs. Concerns were expressed regarding the lack of opportunity for participation in the decision making process and lack of responsiveness to issues and the lack of clarity to processes. Also of concern, sometimes people overlook the history why the PASS initiative was created. That was through the Peralta African American Association (PAAA) initiative to address the issue with the achievement gap of Black and Latino students.

Per Dr. Webb, the President always made the decision. She honored the difference of opinion. Regarding the FAB lab, she made a commitment independent of the money from the PASS program. With regards to the decision from the Institutional Effectiveness Committee, there was no directing of the group. The group was to make their own recommendation.

Mrs. Weintraub asked who's determining the funding source of faculty in different disciplines.

Per VC Little, all full-time faculty are funded with General Fund. Adjunct salary are funded with some General Fund and some parcel tax. From the District's perspective, it doesn't make a difference which adjunct faculty, other than those in core programs, is funded until we get closer to the funds expiring (2020). Next year or the year after, we will have to begin this conversation.

7. Response to Committee Questions (Vice Chancellor for Finance and Administration Ron Little)

A handout was provided.

Question 1: These codes are not object codes; they are activity codes within the District's accounting system.

Question 2: Covered earlier. Measure B revenues are allocated to the Peralta Colleges based on the District's Budget Allocation Model, a rolling 3-year average of FTES.

Question 3: No full-time faculty was ever hired with the parcel tax fund.

Mrs. Weintraub asked if there is a certain amount of Measure B funding that is supposed to be spent each year?

VC Little replied that the voters approved to be assessed \$48 every year on their parcel to be provided to the District. There is nothing in the language of the parcel tax that says the District has to expend every dollar in every given year. The voters are putting their trust in the District to spend it effectively as possible. The only money we're not spending in full annually is the PASS program original allocation that colleges continue to spend down.

8. Finance Reports (Vice Chancellor for Finance and Administration Ron Little)

Measure B: Actuals for the last three years and the current budget for parcel tax ending fund balance is the PASS program. We will continue to spend down the PASS funds this year.

Measure A: Fourth column to the right lists the 2015/16 expenses from July 1, 2015 through December 31, 2015 at \$6.45 million. Available balance is \$125 million. A budget of \$405 million was allocated for this fiscal year. Cumulative expenses are at \$279 million. The back page is what we've expended by vendor. The difference may be due to some administrative cost: salary or legal cost not reflected.

Mrs. Weinstein requested that we take the categories of Measure B and underneath that list the expenses. We want the budget codes to be connected to the language of Measure B.

In the future, VC Little will present the information in two ways: one like the current version and the other as Mrs. Weinstein requested.

Mr. Kurrasch reminded the group that we are an oversight committee. The minutiae of individual expenditures are not within our purview.

9. Capital Projects Report (Vice Chancellor for General Services Sadiq Ikharo)

Dr. Ikharo explained that the numbers reflect up to December 31, 2015. Pages 8 and 9 are missing. We expect to go out this spring to sell (if possible) the remaining \$115 million (Measure A) in bonds. This will enable the District to fund the rest of the projects that were committed. DGS is going to the Board with an architect to begin the design for the 2118 Milvia building. Buildings will be painted at the College of Alameda. Laney will hold a ground breaking ceremony for their BEST Center. The date is to be determined. Laney's women's locker rooms will be worked on. Their welding lab will be refurbished. The Theatre will get a new stage and new rigging. Merritt's parking lot D will be repaired.

District-wide emergency telephones will be installed.

10. Calendar of Upcoming Meetings (Chairperson Mills)

We will hold quarterly meetings on the second Wednesday. The next meeting will be held on April 13, 2016 from 3:00 – 4:30 p.m. in the DGS Conference Room #1.

11. Announcements

12. Closing Remarks

Meeting adjourned at 4:33 p.m.